

Commonwealth of Virginia Department of General Services Division of Consolidated Laboratory Services BUREAU OF FORENSIC SCIENCE

COPY

CERTIFICATE OF ANALYSIS

September 18, 1989

TO:

Bedford County Sheriff's Department

ATTN: R. W. Gardner

P.O. Box 507

Bedford, VA 24523

Western Laboratory 920 S. Jefferson Street Room #219 Roanoke, Virginia 24018

Tel. No. (703) 857-7192

Your Case #

11538

Victim(s):

FS Lab # W89-02207

Examiner: Elmer Gist, Jr.

Suspect(s):

Items 1A-1E

Item 1F

Item 1G

Item 11

RODRIGUEZ, Hector

Evidence Submitted By:

R. W. Gardner

Substances from scene

Piece of carpet from scene

Substance from scene

Item 1H Piece of carpet from scene

Substance from scene

Item 1J Plastic bag from scene

Item 1K "Floor mat runner" from scene
Item 1L "Floor mat runner" from scene

Items 1M-10 Substances from scene
Items 2A and 2B Substances from scene

Item 2C "Floor mat runner" from scene

Item 2D-2G Substancesfrom scene
Items 3A and 3B Substancesfrom scene

Item 4A Natch from scene

Items 4B and 4C Substances from scene
Item 4D Bedspread from scene

Item 6B Butcher knife from scene

Item 6C Butcher knife from scene

Item 6D Pair of shoes from scene

Item 6E Sock from scene

Item 6F Wine bottle from scene
Item 6G Plastic bag from scene
Item 6H Pair of shoes from scene

Item 61 Blue jeans from scene
Item 6J Telephone from scene

Date Received 4/26/89

FS LAB #W89-02207 September 18, 1989

Evidence Submitted (cont'd):

Items 6L and 6M

Substances from scene

Cigarette lighter from scene Item 6N

Substances from scene Items 6 0-6 Q Pillowcase from scene Item 6R

Item 65 Sheet from scene

Item 6A1 One (1) hair from right hand

Evidence Submitted By: R. W. Gardner Date Received: 4/28/89

Six (6) curtains from scene Item 4D1 Item 6T Shirt and undershirt from scene Refrigerator doorfrom scene Item 2H

Evidence Submitted By: David W. Oxley, M.D. Date Received: 5/03/89

Blood sample from Item CME-1 Item CME-2 Clothing from

Date Received: 5/11/89 Evidence Submitted By: R. W. Gardner

Item 7 Blood sample from Hector Rodriguez

Evidence Submitted By: R. W. Gardner Date Received: 6/14/89

Blood sample from Hector Rodriguez Item 10 Head hair sample from Hector Rodriguez Item 11

RESULTS:

Items 1A-1D Each of the substances from the scene consisted of human blood

type ABO A.

Item 1E The substance from the scene consisted of human blood which was

too limited in amount for blood type determination.

Items 1F and 1G Human blood type ABO A was identified on the piece of carpet

and in the substance from scene.

Items 1H and 1I Human blood which was too limited in amount for blood type deter-

mination was identified in the carpet and in the substance from

the scene.

Items 1J-10 Human blood type ABO A was identified on the plastic bag, "floor

mat runners" and in the substances from the scene.

Items 2A-2F Human blood type ABO A was identified on the "floor mat runners"

and in the substances from the scene.

Page 2 of 4

W89-02207 Sept. 18, 1989

RESULTS CONT ...

Item 2G The substance from the scene consisted of human blood which was too limited in amount for blood type determination.

Items 3A, 3B and 4A Human blood type ABO A was identified on the watch and in the substances from the scene.

Items 4B and 4C Human blood which was too limited in amount for blood type determination was identified in the substances from the scene.

Items 4D and 6B-6J Human blood type ABO A was identified on the bedspread, butcher knives, shoes, sock, wine bottle, plastic bag and telephone from the scene.

Item 6L Human blood which was too limited in amount for blood type determination was identified in the substance from the scene.

Item 6M Human blood type ABO A was identified in the substance from the scene.

Item 6N Human blood which was too limited in amount for blood type determination was identified on the cigarette lighter.

Item 60 Human blood type ABO A was identified in the substance from the scene.

Item 6P Human blood type ABO 0 was identified in the substance from the scene.

Items 6Q-6S Human blood type ABO A was identified on the pillowcase, sheet and in the substance from the scene.

Item 6A1 The hair from right hand was consistent with the head hairs from Hector Rodriguez (Item 11).

Item 4D1 Human blood type ABO A was identified on three (3) of the curtains from the scene. No blood was identified on the other three (3) curtains.

Item 6T Human blood type ABO A was identified on the shirt and undershirt from the scene.

Item 2H Human blood which was too limited in amount for blood type determination was identified on the refrigerator door from the scene.

Item CME-1 The blood sample from was type ABO A.

Item CME-2 Not examined.

FS LAB #W89-02:				
September 18, 1	1989			
RESULTS (cont'd	1.):			
100000000	/			
		•		
30				
* . *	* of			
-1 12 -3 30	mb 1.3 3			
Items 7 and 10	The blood samp.	les from Hactor Rodrig	dez were type ABO O.	
3.42				
CONCLUSION:				
				1000
The blood stain	s which have been identifi	led as type ABO A cou	ld have originated for	com
and coul	d not have originated fro	om Hector Rodriguez.		
The single bloo	d stain which has been id	lentified as type ABO	O (Item 6P) could ha	ave
	Hector Rodriguez and cou			
			. =	57.
The hair from t	he right hand of	could have ori	ginated from Hector F	Rodriamez.
				The state of the s
The recults of	the other requested exami	nations were previous	sly reported	
THE PERGICS OF	the other requested exam	macrons were previous	bay reported.	
mus Sidd Samue to	halve datalog for some			
The evidence is	being retained for perso	har pick up.		
			1	
cc: David W. C	oxley, M.D.			
	Lef Medical Examiner			
			11	

STATE OF VIRGINIA
CITY/COUNTY OF ROANOKE, to-wit:

EG/sk

THIS day personally appeared before me,

M. Diane Lord

, a notary public, in and for said city/county in the

Commonwealth of Virginia, Simor Cist Jr., who signed the foregoing Certificate of Analysis, before me, and after being duly sworn, made cath (1) that he performed the analysis and/or examination the results of which are herein contained, (2) that said analysis and/or examination was performed in a laboratory operated by the Division of Consolidated Laboratory Services of the Commonwealth or authorized by such Division to conduct such analysis and/or examination and (3) that this Certificate of Analysis is true and correct.

Given under my hand this_

19 day of_

Sentember, 19 89

male ... Jos

Notary Public

My commission expires January 17 , 18 _____90

1	A Yes.				
2	MR. UPDIKE: All right, Mr. Grimm. If				
3	you'd answer any questions then counsel may				
4	have.				
5	MR. KURTIN: Obviously we have no				
6	questions.				
7	THE COURT: Thank you, Mr. Grimm.				
8	MR. UPDIKE: We wish to call Elmer				
9	Guist next, please.				
0					
11	The witness, ELMER GUIST, JR., having first been				
12	duly sworn, testifies as follows:				
13					
14	DIRECT EXAMINATION				
15					
16	BY MR. UPDIKE:				
17	Q State your name, please, sir.				
8	A My name is Elmer Guist, Jr.				
19	Q Your profession is what?				
20	A I'm a forensic serologist specializing in				
21	identification and typing of blood and body fluid stains				
22	and identification and comparison of hairs and natural				
23	fibers.				
24	MR. KURTIN: We will stipulate to his				
25	expertise.				

MR. UPDIKE: All right, sir. THE COURT: So ruled.

3

BY MR. UPDIKE:

5 6

4

2

7

8

10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23 24

25

Mr. Guist, I'd like to ask you about a Q number of items that you had the occasion to analyze. I'm going to ask Captain Laughlin here to help me so that we can kind of move them along very quickly, and ask you if you had the occasion to analyze them and what, if any, findings that you made concerning those.

What I'd like to start with, first of all, before we go in order of the things, I would like to take the blood samples themselves, which would be Commonwealth's Exhibits One Twenty-five and One Twenty-six, just the blood samples, I think they are right here. Excuse me, Commonwealth's Exhibits One Thirty-four and One Twenty-six, which were submitted to you as items Seven and Ten, okay, and ask you if you had the occasion to analyze those?

- Yes, I did. A
- After analyzing both of those, what if any determination did you make?
- I determined that the blood type was ABO Type 0.
 - And both of these are marked and identified 0

1	as blood samples of the defendant, Hector Rodriguez?				
2	A That's correct. That's what's written on				
3	the plastic bag.				
4	Q And the CME sample pertaining to the blood				
5	of CME 1, if I could ask you				
6	MR. KURTIN: Mr. Updike, you can ask him				
7	without finding it.				
8	MR. UPDIKE: Okay. Thank you very much.				
9					
10	BY MR. UPDIKE:				
11	Q You had the occasion to analyze CME 1, a				
12	blood sample from , for blood-typing, is that				
13	correct?				
14	A Yes, sir, that's correct.				
15	Q And after doing that, your determination as				
16	to the blood type of blood was what?				
17	A It was type ABO Type A.				
18	Q So blood is Type A, the				
19	defendant's was Type O?				
20	A That's correct.				
21	Q If we could go through these items. First				
22	of all, beginning with substance 1-A. We'll just start				
23	with the different rooms and I think that we've got them				
24	grouped there so that we can move them. I think once I				
25	get these here, Mr. Guist, that I will be able to move				

through them much more guickly.

First of all showing you Commonwealth's Exhibit Number Fifty and ask you if you had the occasion to analyze that?

- A Yes, sir, I did.
- Q And what was the determination?
- A I determined the presence of human blood, Type ABO A on the swabs.
 - Q And that's 1-A?
 - A That's correct.

MR. UPDIKE: Now, Your Honor, to try to help organize this, what I would like to ask of Mr. Guist, on the diagram that we've used on the screen and that the ladies and gentlemen have seen, where we have, for example, 1-A, I would like for him to just write on this sheet, which is not the one introduced but is the same thing, just to write on there A. so that we know that's Type A.

THE COURT: I don't see any problem with that.

BY MR. UPDIKE:

- Q Would you mind doing that, Mr. Guist?
- A That's fine.

1 And we'll just continue with that procedure Q 2 throughout. And proceeding to 1-B, if I can ask you if 3 you had the occasion to analyze that? 4 MR. KURTIN: We will waive all the 5 preparatory questions. Of course he's examined 6 them all and he can just go right ahead and 7 write down or give his results. That's fine. 8 MR. UPDIKE: Okay. So without showing 9 them to him, is that okay? 10 MR. KURTIN: Sure. If he has the results, 11 fine. 12 MR. UPDIKE: So I wouldn't have to find 13 each particular item? 14 MR. KURTIN: No. sir. 15 MR. UPDIKE: Okay. That will be fine and 16 that will help speed things up. 17 18 BY MR. UPDIKE: 19 It's stipulated that you've seen these Q 20 items and maybe we'll just use your report without me 21 having to find each and every one of them. First of all, 22 Item 1-B, which is identified as a swab taken from Room 23 One, did you have the occasion to analyze that? 24 Yes, I did. A 25 And your finding concerning that? Page 218

Human blood Type ABO A was identified on A 2 that item. 3 And Mr. Guist, If you wouldn't mind, on 1-B 4 there, just writing Type A. Proceeding to Item 1-C, 5 please, your findings concerning that? 6 I identified human blood Type ABO A on that 7 sample also. 8 And if you would write that on 1-C, please. 9 Item 1-D, sir? 10 Same findings, ABO, human blood, Type A. A 11 If you would write that, please. 12 Proceeding to Item 1-E, again a swab from the scene, your 13 finding, please? 14 I identified human blood, but it was too 15 limited an amount for ABO blood type determination on that 16 particular specimen. 17 And I won't ask you to write anything. If 18 you don't write anything, you weren't able to make a 19 finding as to that. Proceeding to Item 1-F, a piece of 20 carpet from the living room? 21 There was human blood Type ABO A on the 22 piece of carpet. 23 If you could write that on the chart, 24 please, at 1-F. Item 1-G, a substance from the scene? 25 I found human blood, Type ABO A on the Page 219

1 substance from the scene. 2 Item 1-H, a piece of -- Well, first of all, 3 1-G. you found that as Type A? 4 A That is correct. 5 And if you'd write that on the sheet at Q 6 1-G? 7 I did. 8 Okay. Item 1-H, please, identified as a 9 piece of carpet from the living room? I found human blood which was too limited 10 11 an amount for a blood type determination on the piece of 12 carpet. 13 Item 1-I, a swab taken from the living room Q 14 area? 15 I found human blood which was too limited 16 an amount for blood type determination on the substance 17 from the scene. 18 Item 1-J, identified as a plastic bag on 19 the living room couch, your findings as to that? 20 I found human blood, Type ABO A on the A 21 plastic bag. 22 If you would write that, please, on Item 23 1-J. Item 1-K which was the floor mat in the living room 24 area, your findings as to that? 25 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on

1 that item. If you would write that on the chart, 2 3 Item 1-L, the floor mat? please, sir. Human blood, Type ABO was identified on 4 A 5 that item. 6 Excuse me. Type ABO? 7 ABO Type A was identified on that item. A All right. sir. And that was 1-L, I think? 8 Q 9 That's correct, 1-L. A 10 And Item 1-M which was a substance, a swab, Q 11 in the living room area? 12 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on A 13 that Item. 14 If you would mark that on the chart, 15 please. Item 1-N, a substance which was swabbed from the 16 living room area of the home? 17 That was also human blood, Type ABO A. 18 If you would write that on the chart, Q 19 please. Item 1-0, a substance that was swabbed from the 20 living room area? 21 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on 22 that staining as well. 23 Again, if you would write that on the chart for us. Mr. Guist, if we could proceed to the items from 24 25 Room Two. And what I've been trying to do is to find the

1 transparency just to have that on the screen identifying 2 the items as we're talking about them. Okay. Proceeding with Item 2-A, a substance swabbed from the kitchen area? 3 4 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on 5 that substance. 6 Item 2-B? 7 Human blood, Type ABO A also on that 8 substance as well. From the door there. So if you would write 9 10 Type A on both of those, please. Item 2-C, identified as 11 the floor mat in this area of the dining room and kitchen 12 area? 13 Human blood, Type ABO Type A was identified A 14 on the floor mat. 15 And if you would write that, please. Item 16 2-D, a swab from this area around the door, rear door? 17 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified in A 18 that stain. 19 If you would write that, please. Item 2-E, Q 20 which is identified as a swab from this area of the wall 21 near the door? 22 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on A 23 the swab, sir. 24 If you would write that, please. Item 2-F, 25 again a swab from this area of the wall near the rear

1 door? 2 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on A 3 that swab as well. 4 If you would write that on the chart, Q 5 please. Item 2-G, identified as a swab from the 6 refrigerator door? Human blood which was too limited in amount 7 for blood type determination was identified on that item. 8 9 Item 2-H, which is the refrigerator door 10 itself, your findings as to that, please? Human blood which was too limited in amount 11 A 12 for blood type determination was identified on the 13 refrigerator door. 14 Next I'd like to ask you about Item 3 and 15 if I could quickly put this on the overhead projector. Item 3-A, which was at the far end of the hallway near the 16 17 other bedroom, if you would state your findings as to 18 that, a swab from that area? 19 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on A 20 that staining. 21 If you could write that, please. Item 3-B 22 at the entranceway to the other bedroom? 23 Human blood, Type ABO Type A was identified A 24 on that staining as well. 25 And if you could write that on our chart,

1 please. Sir, proceeding to the items from Area Four, this 2 being the front bedroom, and asking you about Item 4-A 3 which was the watch found behind the bedroom door in this area, your findings as to that, please? 5 Human blood, Type ABO Type A was identified A 6 on the watch. 7 If you could write that, please. Item 4-B 8 which is a swab from this area around the door of the 9 bedroom, inside door of the bedroom? 10 Human blood which was too limited an amount A 11 for blood type determination was identified in that 12 particular stain. 13 Item 4-C which is a swabbing from the 14 carpet floor in front of the doorway inside the bedroom? 15 I identified human blood which was too 16 limited an amount for blood type determinations on those 17 swabs. 18 Item 4-D which is the bedspread which was 0 19 on the bed inside the bedroom? 20 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on A 21 the bedspread. 22 If you would write that, please. 23 4-D-1 which was the curtains lying on the bed there in the 24 bedroom? 25 I identified human blood, Type ABO A on the

1 curtains. 2 Sir, if you would write that down, please. And then proceeding to the bedroom where body 3 4 was, Area Six, beginning with Item 6-B the butcher knife 5 from the right hand of 6 I found human blood, Type ABO A on the A 7 knife. 8 Type A? Q 9 That's right, ABO Type A. A 10 If you would write that please. Item 6-C, the butcher knife from the area where Hector Rodriguez's 11 12 body was? 13 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on A 14 the butcher knife. 15 There was Type A on that butcher knife as 16 well? 17 A On 6-C? 18 Q Yes. 19 A That's correct. Item 6-D which were the items identified as 20 21 tennis shoes inside the closet? 22 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on 23 the tennis shoes. 24 If you would that, it's there in two 25 places. Right here and here (indicating). Item 6-E,

identified as a small sock inside the closet? Human blood, Type ABO Type A was identified 2 3 on the sock. If you would write that, please. Item 6-F, 4 identified as the wine bottle inside the closet? 5 A Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on 6 7 the wine bottle. Q If you would write that. Item 6-G, the 8 9 plastic bag inside the closet? A Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on 10 11 the plastic bag. 12 If you would write that. Item 6-H identified as the defendant's shoes? Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on 14 15 the shoes. 16 So the blood consistent with blood was on the defendant's shoes? 17 18 That's correct. A 19 Q If you would write that. 20 A Yes, sir. Item 6-I which would be the blue jeans worn 21 G 22 by the defendant? 23 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on A 24 the blue Jeans. 25 Q His blue jeans?

1 That's correct. A All right. I don't think that 6-I -- Yes, 2 it is designated. I'm sorry. Right here (indicating). 3 Item 6-J which is identified as the telephone over here? I identified human blood, Type ABO A on the 5 A 6 telephone. If you would write that, please. Item 6-L 7 -- 6-K was not submitted -- Item 6-L Identified as a 8 swabbing from the closet door where the writing appeared? 9 Human blood which was too limited an amount 10 for blood type determination was identified on those 11 12 swabs. Item 6-N, the cigarette lighter found in 13 Q this area in front of the closet door? 14 Human blood which was too limited in amount 15 for blood type determination was identified on the 16 17 cigarette lighter. Item 6-0, a swabbing of the substance found 18 19 on the dresser in this area? Human blood, Type ABO was identified on 20 A 21 those swabs. 22 That was ABO Type A? 23 A Type A. Thank you. If you would write that, 24 please. And Item 6-P, a small table, a swabbing from the 25

1 substance on that small table? Human blood, Type ABO Type O was identified 2 3 in that sample. So that particular finding was Type O 4 Q 5 blood? 6 That's correct. A 7 Item 6-Q which is a swabbing from the O carpet area in front of the bed, in this area, 6-Q? 8 Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on 9 10 those swabs. If you would mark that, please. Item 6-R, 11 12 identified as the pillow case on the bed? Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on 13 A 14 the pillow case. Designate that please. Item 6-S identified 15 16 as the sheet on the bed itself? Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on 17 18 the sheet. And Item 6-T identified as the defendant's 19 20 shirt and undershirt? Human blood, Type ABO A was identified on 21 22 the shirt and the undershirt. 23 Type A there? Q 24 A Type A. 25 So that the findings that you were able to Page 228

make, in summary, Mr. Guist, is it correct that the only 1 place that you found Type O blood, that was consistent 2 with the defendant's, was 6-P, the little table identified here? That's correct, yes. A Everything else was Type O, that was in Q sufficient amounts to categorize? Everything else was Type A. Type A, excuse me. Type A. Now, in addition to those Items, I'd like to ask you about Item 6-A-1 which was identified as a hair taken from right hand at the morgue in Roanoke. Did you have the occasion to compare that with Item 11, a sample of the defendant's hair? Yes, sir, I did. And your findings in that regard, please? I found that the hair from A right hand was consistent with the head hairs from the 18 defendant. And I'm checking, Mr. Guist, but at least Q according to my checklist, I believe that would be the extent of your evaluations and findings in this regard. There are quite a number of Items. If I could just check

here and make sure. And do you have that chart there that

you very kindly agreed to write on for us?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Yes. (Witness hands chart to Mr. Updike.) 1 A MR. UPDIKE: Thank you very much, 2 Mr. Guist. If you'd answer any questions 3 counsel may have. And Your Honor, we'll ask 4 that this particular chart be introduced. 5 6 (Commonwealth's Exhibit Number One Hundred Forty-two 7 was marked and introduced into evidence.) 8 9 MR. KURTIN: Can I have Exhibit One-O-Eight 10 please? 11 12 CROSS EXAMINATION 13 14 BY MR. KURTIN: 15 Mr. Guist, while the Deputy and Clerk are 16 trying to find Exhibit One-O-Eight for me, let me tell you 17 that Exhibit One-O-Eight is 6-C, located right here, okay? 18 A Yes, sir. 19 I'm going to give you back what is now 20 Exhibit One Forty-two, the diagram you wrote all over --21 A Yes. 22 And you have your original report in your 23 hand, I believe, do you not? 24 That's correct, yes. 25 A

Would you double check your report, because Q 1 I believe just a minute ago you testified that you found 2 Type A blood on that 6-C right here. Did you double check 3 your report? 4 Yes, sir. I've double checked it and it's 5 6 Type A. Type A on 6-C. Would you take a look at 7 Q this for us and make sure that's what you checked? 8 Yes, sir. That's the case number, item 9 A number and my initials on it. 10 Let me ask you a question about this. Q 11 You're sure that Mr. Rodriguez's blood was Type 0? 12 That's correct, yes. 13 blood was Type A? And 14 That's correct. 15 A Are you aware that this knife was found by 16 the police sticking two inches into Mr. Rodriguez and 17 you're saying that it didn't have his blood on it but had 18 somebody else's blood on it? 19 I found no indication in the stain I typed 20 of any Type O. It's quite possible to put a knife into a 21 wound and pull it out and leave very little blood 22 remaining. The blood that's on there, that you see there, 23 that I typed, is Type A. It's Type A. I found no 24 indication of Type O, regardless of whether it was taken 25

out of his body or not makes no difference.

Q Well, have you ever seen the wound that it was taken out of? Have you ever seen the wound?

A No. I have not.

Q Because it wasn't just stuck in like that, as you have indicated might be the answer. This is Exhibit Thirty-seven which I'm going to show you in a second, if we can find the slide number that goes with Exhibit Thirty-seven.

Just so you can see what we're talking about, this is the actual Exhibit Number Thirty-seven?

A Yes. I can see it.

Q And that slide was taken from the exhibit, okay?

A Yes, sir.

Q Now, the knife was -- As you can see, it's not just a stabbing of the point in, it's a slash wound that Dr. Keeley was here and testified about as fourteen centimeters. That is approximately five inches long and it was deep enough that it sliced through the muscle and through the exterior jugular vein. And so the knife being found in that position in Mr. Rodriguez's body, found by the police, as I've said, in that position, you're saying you found somebody else's blood on it and not any of his?

A That's correct, yes, sir.

MR. KURTIN: I have no further questions.

3

16

24

25

REDIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. UPDIKE:

Mr. Gulst, I neglected to do you one thing and this is ask you, is this the original of your report?

> Yes, it is. A

With the findings that you've already gone over with us?

Yes, sir.

MR. UPDIKE: We'd just like to go ahead and introduce that, please. And we have no further questions of Mr. Guist.

(Commonwealth's Exhibit Number One Hundred Forty-three was marked and introduced into evidence.)

> THE COURT: All right. Thank you. You're excused. sir.

MR. UPDIKE: Geoff Brown would be our next witness, Your Honor.